BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 10082840 9

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

LAW LIBRARY
OCT 9 1935
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

https://archive.org/details/casesmaterialson00mack

CASES AND MATERIALS ON CRIMINAL LAW

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER I — PURPOSE OF CRIMINAL LAW

R. v. Jones, 115 Can. C.C. 273 — 1
R. v. Sinnisiak, unreptd. — 4
Crime Prevention and Judicial Casuistry — 5

CHAPTER II — CRIMINAL LIABILITY AND THE "GUILTY ACT"

(A) Nature of an Act

R. v. Charlson, [1955] 1 All E.R. 859 — 8
Fain v. Commonwealth, 78 Ky. 183 — 13
R. v. Larsonneur, 149 L.T. 542 — 17
Slattery v. Haley, 52 O.L.R. 95 — 18
R. v. Shaw, 70 Can. C.C. 159 — 19

(B) The Nature of Mens Rea; The Problem of Statutory Interpretation.

R. v. Tolson, 16 Cox C.C. 629 — 20
The Queen v. Prince, L.R. 2 C.C.R. 154 — 31
R. v. Rees, 115 Can. C.C. 1 — 35
R. v. McLeod, 111 Can. C.C. 106 — 40

(C) Mens Rea of Intention

The Queen v. Martin, 8 Q.B.D. 54 — 46
R. v. Welch, 1 Q.B.D. 23 — 48
R. v. Harris & Atkins, 15 Cox C.C. 75 — 49
Studstill v. State, 7 Ga. 2 — 50
R. v. Steane, [1947] 1 All E.R. 813 — 50
Thabo Meli v. R., [1954] 1 All E.R. 373 — 53
R. v. Machekequonabe, 28 O.R. 309 — 54

(D) Mens Rea of Recklessness; Herein of Criminal Negligence.

R. v. Benge, 176 E.R. 665 — 56
People v. Clemente, 130 N.Y.S. 612 — 57
Akerle v. R., [1943] A.C. 255 — 58
Commonwealth v. Bouvier, 55 N.E. (2d.) 913 — 59
R. v. Baker, 51 Can. C.C. 60 — 60
Andrews v. D.P.P., [1937] A.C. 576 — 64
R. v. Nickle, 34 Can. C.C. 15 — 67
People v. John Dunleavy, [1948] I.R. 95 — 70
Commonwealth v. Welansky, 55 N.E. (2d.) 902 — 74
People v. Young, 129 P. (2d.) 353 — 80
R. v. Dant, 169 E.R. 1517 — 82
R. v. Finney, 12 Cox C.C. 625 — 83
R. v. Gagnon, 115 Can. C.C. 82 — 84
R. v. Markuss, 176 E.R. 598 — 86

(E) Proof of Mens Rea

Commonwealth v. Pierce, 138 Mass. 165 — 87
R. v. Burdee, 12 Cr. App. R. 153 — 90
R. v. Ward, 40 Cr. App. R. 1 — 92
R. v. Stones, 56 St. Rep. 25 — 94
Moreland, The Law of Homicide — 97
R. v. Wagstaffe, 10 Cox C.C. 530 — 98
R. v. Grout, 172 E.R. 1394 — 100
Wilson v. Inyang [1951] 2 K.B. 799 — 101
R. v. Reece, 109 Can. C.C. 26 — 103
R. v. Piggly Wiggly Canadian Ltd., 60 Can. C.C. 104 — 106
Reynolds v. G.H. Austin, [1951] 1 All E.R. 606 — 110
R. v. Hawinda Taverns Ltd., 112 Can. C.C. 301 — 113
Allan v. Whitehead, [1930] 1 K.B. 211 — 118
Sayre, Public Welfare Offenses — 120
R. v. Ford, 12 Can. C.C. 555 — 123
Woolmington v. D.P.P., [1935] A.C. 462 — 123
R. v. Macklin, 2 Lew. C.C. 225 — 125
R. v. Giannotti, 115 Can. C.C. 203 — 126

CHAPTER III THE PROBLEM OF JUSTIFICATION

(A) Protection of Life and Limb
People v. Hecker, 42 P. 307 132
R. v. Ogal, 50 Can. C.C. 71 134
R. v. Dunham, 95 Can. C.C. 317 135
R. v. Rose, 15 Cox C.C. 136
R. v. Scott, 15 Can. C.C. 442 138
R. v. Moke, 28 Can. C.C. 296 139
R. v. Hussey, 18 Cr. App. R. 160 140
State v. Goode, 195 S.W. 1006 141
R. v. Dudley and Stephens, 14 Q.B.D. 273 142
U.S. v. Holmes, 26 Fed. Cas. 360 147
R. v. Bourne, [1938] 3 All E.R. 615 148
R. v. Simpson, 84 L.J.K.B. 1893 151
People v. Roberts, 178 N.W. 690 152
Repouille v. U.S., 165 Fed. (2d.) 1952 152
State v. Nargasian, 58 Atl. 953 153
Dunbar v. The King, 67 Can. C.C. 20 155

(B) Protection of Property
R. v. Ryan, 116 Can. C.C. 239 156
People v. Smith, 88 N.E. (2d.) 444 156
Carroll v. Commonwealth, 299 S.W. 183 157
People v. Eatman, 91 N.E. (2d.) 387 159
Bangren v. State, 17 So. (2d.) 599 160

(C) Prevention of Crime and Apprehension of Criminals
R. v. Hastings, 90 Can. C.C. 150 162
Koechlin v. Waugh, 118 Can. C.C. 24 166
R. ex rel. A.-G. Can. v. Sandford, 118 Can. C.C. 93 169
Proceedings of American Law Institute 174

(D) Superior Orders
R. v. Smith, 17 S.C.R. (Cape Colony) 561 175
State v. Roy, 64 S.E. (2d.) 840 176
U.S. v. Von Leeb [Nuremberg Trials] 176

(E) Provocation
Bedder v. D.P.P., [1954] 2 All E.R. 801 178
R. v. Lesbini, 11 Cr. App. R. 7 181
R. v. Alexander, 9 Cr. App. R. 140 183
Fisher v. U.S., 328 U.S. 403 183
R. v. McCarthy, 38 Cr. App. R. 74 186
R. v. Gauthier, 29 Cr. App. R. 113 189
R. v. Linton, 93 Can. C.C. 97 191
Taylor v. The King, 89 Can. C.C. 209 191
R. v. Smith, 176 E.R. 910 198
R. v. Krawchuk, 75 Can. C.C. 16 198
R. v. Gorczak, 103 Can. C.C. 82 200
R. v. Duffy, [1949] 1 All E.R. 932 200
R. v. Tripodi, 112 Can. C.C. 66 201
Scroggs v. State, 93 S.E. (2d.) 583 206
R. v. Harrington, 10 Cox C.C. 370 207
Dixon v. State, 289 S.W. 46 208
R. v. Manchuk, 68 Can. C.C. 362 208
R. v. Jackson, 75 Can. C.C. 306 212
R. v. Gross, 23 Cox C.C. 455 216

CHAPTER IV THE PROBLEM OF OMISSIONS
Commonwealth v. Cali, 141 N.E. 510 217
India Law Commissioners - Penal Code 217
Ames, Law and Morals 219
People v. Beardsley, 113 N.W. 1128 220
R. v. Russell, [1932] Vict. L.R. 59 223
R. v. Lewis, 7 Can. C.C. 261 225
R. v. Mabbet, 5 Cox C.C. 339 228
R. Gibbons & Proctor, 13 Cr. App. R. 134 228
R. v. Sidney, 20 Can. C.C. 376 229
R. v. Bonnyman, 28 Cr. App. R. 131 231
R. v. Chattaway, 17 Cr. App. R. 7 232

R. v. Shepherd, 31 L.J.M.C. 102 232
R. v. Izod, 20 Cox. C.C. 690 233
R. v. Hall, 14 Cr. App. r. 58 234
R. v. Pittwood, 19 T.L.R. 37 235
R. v. Hurt, 55 O.L.R. 48 235

CHAPTER V THE PROBLEM OF CAUSATION
R. v. Bennett, 8 Cox C.C. 74 236
R. v. Clucas, [1949] 2 All E.R. 40 238
R. v. Davis & Wagstaffe, 15 Cox C.C. 174 239
State v. Snider, 94 S.E. 981 240
R. v. Godin, 71 Can. C.C. 262 241
People v. Fowler, 174 P. 892 242
R. v. Michael, 173 E.R. 867 244
State v. Angelina, 81 S.E. 141 244
People v. Lewis, 57 P. 470 246
R. v. Beech, 23 Cox C.C. 181 249
R. v. Pitts, 174 E.R. 509 249
R. v. Kissick, 69 Can. C.C. 403 250
R. v. Holland, 174 E.R. 313 251

CHAPTER VI SELECTED OFFENCES AND PROBLEMS RELATED TO LIFE AND LIMB

(A) Murder
R. v. Saunders & Archer, Fosters Crown Law 371 252
R. v. Hopwood, 8 Cr. App. R. 143 252
R. v. Hughes, 78 Can. C.C. 257 252
R. v. Serné, 16 Cox C.C. 311 256
Rowe v. The King, 100 Can. C.C. 97 258
R. v. Betts & Ridley, 22 Cr. App. R. 148 266
R. v. Jarmain, [1946] K.B. 74 268
People v. Cabaltero, 87 P. (2d.) 364 271
R. v. Fitton, 115 Can. C.C. 225 274
Commonwealth v. Moore, 88 S.W. 1085 276
Commonwealth v. Thomas, 117 Atl. (2d.) 204 277
Cathro v. The Queen, 113 Can. C.C. 225 287
Chow Bew v. The Queen, 113 Can. C.C. 337 291
R. v. Eng Git Lee, 116 Can. C.C. 316 297
R. v. Guay & Guay, 117 Can. C.C. 174 300

(B) Assault
(i) Rape
R. v. Miller, [1954] 2 All E.R. 529 305
R. v. Ram & Rame, 17 Cox C.C. 609 310
R. v. Bursey, 118 Can. C.C. 219 310
State v. Welch, 89 S.W. 945 315
R. v. Williams, [1923] 1 K.B. 340 316
R. v. Harms, 81 Can. C.C. 4 317
(ii) Carnal Knowledge
R. v. Johnston, 91 Can. C.C. 59 320
R. v. Wiberg, 113 Can. C.C. 257 322
(iii) Indecent Assault and Gross Indecency
R. v. Louie Chong, 23 Can. C.C. 250 324
R. v. Donovan, [1934] 2 K.B. 498 325
(iv) Common Assault
R. v. Judge, 118 Can. C.C. 410 328
State v. Wiley, 216 N.W. 866 329
(v) Aggravated Assault
R. v. Macdonald, 82 Can. C.C. 47 331
R. v. McLeod, 111 Can. C.C. 106 332
Monk v. Strathern, [1921] S.C. 4 332

CHAPTER VII SELECTED OFFENCES AGAINST PROPERTY

(i) Theft
(a) generally
First Report of Commissioners On Criminal Law 333
R. v. Cabbage, 168 E.R. 809 335
R. v. Harding, 21 Cr. App. R. 166 336

R. v. Taylor, [1911] 1 K.B. 674 337
Henderson v. Northwester Mutual Ins. Co., 43 Can. C.C. 217 338
Brochu v. The King, 10 C.R. 183 339
(b) theft by a trick
R. v. Buckmaster, 20 Q.B.D. 182 341
R. v. Nicholson et al., 168 E.R. 407 342
R. v. Solomons, 17 Cox C.C. 93 343
R. v. Stewart, 1 Cox C.C. 174 344
(c) defences
R. v. Ford, 12 Can. C.C. 555 345
R. v. Bernhard, [1938] 2 K.B. 264 345

(ii) False Pretences
R. v. Hemingway, 112 Can. C.C. 321 349
R. v. Reid, 74 Can. C.C. 156 352
R. v. Kylsant (Lord), [1932] 1 K.B. 442 359
R. v. Hutchinson, 71 Can. C.C. 199 363
R. v. Bryan, 26 L.J.M.M. 84 365

(iii) "Receiving"
R. v. Van Dorn, 116 Can. C.C. 325 368
R. v. Dolan, 24 L.J.M.C. 59 370
R. v. Marabella, 117 Can. C.C. 78 371
R. v. Wiley, 20 L.J.M.C. 4 372
R. v. Sullivan & Godbolt, 85 Can. C.C. 349 374
R. v. Parker, 77 Can. C.C. 9 376
R. v. Morin, 118 Can. C.C. 108 376

(iv) Robbery and Extortion 380
Crankshaw's Cr. Code, 6th ed., p. 526 381
R. v. Boyle & Merchant, 10 Cr. App. R. 180 382
R. v. Pacholko, 75 Can. C.C. 172 383
Thorne v. Motor Trade Assoc., 26 Cr. App. R. 51 386

(v) Arson
R. v. Jorgenson, 111 Can. C.C. 30 387

CHAPTER VIII INCHOATE CRIMES: HEREIN OF ATTEMPTS, CONSPIRACY AND SOLICITATION

(A) Attempts
R. v. Cline, 115 Can. C.C. 18 392
R. v. Goodman, 22 U.C.C.P. 338 396
R. v. Robinson, 11 Cr. App. R. 124 398
Report of Fire Commissioner (N.Y.) 400
Holmes, The Common Law, p. 68-9 401
People v. Miller, 42 P. (2d.) 308 401
R. v. Barker, [1924] N.Z.L.R. 865 402
Commonwealth v. Kennedy, 48 N.E. 770 406
Arnold, Criminal Attempts 407
R. v. Lyons, 16 Can. C.C. 152 408
Foster v. Commonwealth, 31 S.E. 503 410

(B) Conspiracy
Martins Annotated Criminal Code (1955), p. 666 412
R. v. O'Brien, 110 Can. C.C. 1 413
R. v. McRae, 111 Can. C.C. 162 416
U.S. v. Falcone, 109 Fed. (2d.) 579 418
U.S. v. Bruno, 105 Fed. (2d.) 921 419
R. v. Meyrick & Ribuffi, 21 Cr. App. R. 94 420
R. v. Cameron, 64 Can. C.C. 224 422
R. v. Whitchurch, 24 Q.B.D. 420 423
R. v. Whitaker, 10 Cr. App. R. 245 424
R. v. Robinson, 92 Can. C.C. 223 424
R. v. Howell, 176 E.R. 513 424
Commonwealth v. Donoghue, 63 S.W. (2d.) 3 425
McDonald v. U.S., 89 Fed. (2d.) 128 428
Eldredge v. U.S., 62 Fed. (2d.) 449 430
R. v. Sommers (No. 1), 26 W.W.R. (N.S.) 241 432
R. v. Sommers (No. 8), 26 W.W.R. (N.S.) 257 433

R. v. Container Materials Ltd., 74 Can. C.C. 113 434
Rose v. The King, 88 Can. C.C. 114 435
U.S. v. Dennis, 183 Fed. (2d.) 201 436
Holman, Evidence in Conspiracy Cases 436
Krulewitch v. U.S., 336 U.S. 440 437

(C) Counselling (Solicitation)
R. v. Gordon & Gordon, 79 Can. C.C. 315 439
R. v. Brown, 14 Eng. & Em. Dig. (1956), 118 441
R. v. Tyrrell, [1894] 1 Q.B. 710 441

CHAPTER IX ACCESSORIES AND ACCOMPLICES
R. v. Harder, 114 Can. C.C. 129 442
R. v. Kravenia, 112 Can. C.C. 81 444
State v. Tally, 15 So. 722 445
R. v. Rhyno, 83 Can. C.C. 186 448
R. v. Halmo, 76 Can. C.C. 116 449
R. v. Cunningham, 68 Can. C.C. 176 452
R. v. Roy, 3 Can. C.C. 472 453
R. v. Bullock, [1955] 1 All E.R. 15 454
National Coal Board v. Gamble, [1958] 3 All E.R. 203 456
R. v. Coney, 8 Q.B.D. 534 460
R. ex rel Tomlinson v. Hayes, 79 Can. C.C. 358 463
Henderson v. The King, 91 Can. C.C. 97 463
R. v. Croft, 29 Cr. App. R. 169 466
Young v. The King, 98 Can. C.C. 195 467

CHAPTER X LEGAL RESPONSIBILITY

(A) Insanity
Trial of Edward Arnold, 16 How. St. Tr. 695 469
R. v. Bellingham, Old Bailey, 1812 470
Daniel M'Naghten's Case, 8 E.R. 718 470
R. v. Codere, 12 Cr. App. R. 21 472
R. v. Windle, [1952] 2 Q.B. 826 476
People v. Schmidt, 110 N.E. 945 477
Stapleton v. The Queen, 86 C.L.R. 358 479
Royal Commission on Insanity (1956) 481
Durham v. U.S., 214 Fed. (2d.) 862 482
Royal Commission on Insanity (1956) 485
Royal Commission on Capital Punishment (1953) 487

(B) Ignorance
(i) superstition 487
(ii) mistake of fact 487
(iii) mistake of law
R. v. Esop, 173 E.R. 203 487

(C) Drunkenness
D.P.P. v. Beard, [1920] A.C. 479 488

(D) Mental Deficiency
Kirkwood v. H.M. Advocate, [1939] S.C. 36 494

(E) Youth
R. v. Smullin, 91 Can. C.C. 274 496
R. v. Ginnetti, 113 Can. C.C. 223 498